

HISTORIC HOME TEAM

Long & Foster Real Estate • Certified Historic Maryland Properties Specialist

COMPARATIVE MARKET ANALYSIS

A Value Justification for an Extraordinary, One-of-a-Kind Property

THE HENRY MILLER HOUSE • C. 1797

741 Wyndamere Road, Lewisberry (Fairview Township), York County, Pennsylvania 17339

5 Bedrooms | 4.5 Baths | 4,677 Sq. Ft. | 2.54 Acres | Detached Guest & Office Complex

ASKING PRICE

\$849,900

Prepared exclusively for a prospective buyer

Prepared by Gary Gestson, CHMP | Historic Home Team, Long & Foster Real Estate

September 1, 2026

Executive Summary

741 Wyndamere Road is not a typical resale — it is a fully restored, circa-1797 stone residence with an authenticated “Henry Miller and His Wife Eve 1797” roofline inscription, set on 2.54 private acres and paired with a detached guest apartment, executive home office, workshop, historic barn, two vintage silos, and landscaped grounds with a koi pond. No other active or recently sold listing in York County combines this scale of restoration, this depth of historic pedigree, and this footprint of outbuildings and land.

Because a matched, apples-to-apples comparable does not exist, this analysis builds the case for \$849,900 from three independent, verifiable angles rather than a single comp grid:

- Local price-per-square-foot baseline — what ordinary, non-historic homes without acreage or outbuildings are commanding right now within a few miles of the subject.
- Active competing inventory — what a buyer's realistic alternatives are priced at today.
- Replacement / new-construction cost — what it would cost to build a comparable square footage of new, standard-to-premium construction in this market, before any allowance for land, outbuildings, or irreplaceable 18th-century fabric.

Every one of the three lenses lands in the same place: at \$849,900 (\$182/sq. ft.), the subject is priced in line with — or below — ordinary homes and new construction in the immediate market, while including roughly 2.5 acres, a self-contained guest/office complex, a historic barn and outbuildings, and two centuries of restored architectural character that no dollar-per-square-foot figure on an ordinary listing captures. In practical terms: the extraordinary elements of this property are being priced at effectively no premium over an average area home.

1 Subject Property Snapshot

Address	741 Wyndamere Road, Lewisberry, Fairview Township, York County, PA 17339
Asking Price	\$849,900 (\$182 / sq. ft.)
Year Built	1797 — 229 years old, fully restored
Bedrooms / Baths	5 Bedrooms / 4.5 Baths
Living Area	4,677 sq. ft. total (4,326 sq. ft. main residence)
Lot Size	2.54 acres
Garage	2-car attached, plus 2-car detached
Historic Marker	Roofline inscription: “Henry Miller and His Wife Eve 1797”
Fireplaces	Four, including a stone walk-in fireplace
Outbuildings	Detached guest apartment & executive office complex, workshop, historic barn, two vintage silos, garden shed, smokehouse
Grounds	Two-tiered brick patio with fire pit, covered pavilion wired for electric/TV, koi pond, brick barbecue, fully fenced yard, landscaped gardens
Systems	Multi-zone heating/cooling, main-floor laundry, gourmet kitchen with gas cooktop and wet/dry bar

Source: Historic Home Team listing page and public listing data (Redfin, Zillow), pulled September 1, 2026.

What Makes This Property Extraordinary

The restoration preserves original hardwood floors, exposed hand-hewn beams, double staircases, wainscoting, and deep window sills, while quietly layering in the systems a modern buyer expects: multi-zone HVAC, a gourmet kitchen with a gas cooktop and wet/dry bar, ceramic tile, recessed lighting, and stainless appliances. A lower-level speakeasy-style den with a game room and humidor and a French-door walkout to the patio and koi pond round out the main house.

Beyond the main residence, the detached outbuilding complex functions as a self-contained guest suite and income/work space: a full guest apartment (bedroom, kitchen, bath), an executive home office with its own bathroom and recreation room, a 2-car garage, and workshop and storage space. Few properties at any price point in this market offer a turnkey, separate living-and-working structure of this scope in addition to the main house.

2 Why a Traditional Comp Grid Doesn't Apply

A standard CMA works by finding 3-6 recently sold homes that are nearly identical to the subject in age, size, condition, and location, then making small dollar adjustments between them. That model breaks down here, for reasons any buyer's agent will recognize on inspection:

- No comparable age or pedigree — there is no other 1797, fully restored, documented-provenance stone residence that has sold in this immediate market in the last several years.
- No comparable footprint of outbuildings — a detached guest apartment, executive office, workshop, historic barn, and two silos on 2.54 acres is not a feature set that shows up on an ordinary single-family resale.
- No comparable restoration scope — the blend of preserved 18th-century fabric (hand-hewn beams, original floors, four fireplaces) with a full mechanical and finish-level modernization is, by definition, a custom, one-off undertaking.

Rather than force-fitting dissimilar homes into a conventional grid, this analysis instead triangulates value from three defensible, independently verifiable directions — set out in Sections 3 through 5 — and lets the buyer see how consistently they converge on the asking price.

3 Approach 1 — Local Price-Per-Square-Foot Baseline

These are the five most recent nearby sales of ordinary, non-historic homes with no acreage, no outbuildings, and no restoration story — the closest thing to a market floor for this immediate area.

Address	Sold	Price	Beds/Ba	Sq. Ft.	\$ / Sq.Ft.	Notes
655 Red Fox Ct, Lewisberry	Jun 2026	\$536,000	4 / 2.5	2,900	\$185	ordinary resale
635 Gap Rd, Lewisberry	Jun 2026	\$720,000	3 / 3.5	4,164	\$173	ordinary resale
596 Beinhower Rd, Etters	Apr 2026	\$480,000	3 / 2	3,039	\$158	ordinary resale
120 Lakeside Dr, Lewisberry	Jul 2026	\$420,000	4 / 3.5	2,721	\$154	ordinary resale
654 Old Quaker Rd, Lewisberry	Aug 2026	\$575,000	4 / 3	3,450	\$167	ordinary resale
5-Comp Average					\$167	baseline
741 Wyndamere Rd (Subject)	Active	\$849,900	5 / 4.5	4,677	\$182	+9% vs. avg

Source: Redfin sold-comparables data for 741 Wyndamere Rd, pulled September 1, 2026.

At \$182/sq. ft., the subject carries only an 9% premium over the average of these five ordinary neighborhood resales — despite offering roughly five times the land, a detached guest/office complex, a historic barn and silos, and a fully documented 1797 provenance. On a pure square-footage basis, a buyer is paying almost the same rate as for a plain 2,700-4,200 sq. ft. home on a standard lot, and receiving the rest — the acreage, the outbuildings, the history — essentially at no incremental cost.

4 Approach 2 — What Else Can a Buyer Actually Buy Right Now

A buyer with \$850,000-\$900,000 to spend in this market today is not choosing between the subject and a discount — these are the realistic active alternatives, none of which offer acreage, outbuildings, or historic character.

Address	Sold	Price	Beds/Ba	Sq. Ft.	\$ / Sq.Ft.	Notes
661 Hunters Ln, Lewisberry	Active	\$724,900	4 / 4	4,800	\$151	conventional
307 Mountain Rd, Lewisberry	Active	\$649,900	3 / 2	2,600	\$250	conventional
1071 Knoll Dr, Hummelstown	Active	\$899,000	4 / 5	3,900	\$230	conventional
35 Old Dominion Rd, Wellsville	Active	\$599,000	5 / 4	3,400	\$176	conventional
4-Listing Average					\$202	competing avg
741 Wyndamere Rd (Subject)	Active	\$849,900	5 / 4.5	4,677	\$182	-10% vs. avg

Source: Zillow comparable-homes data for 741 Wyndamere Rd, pulled September 1, 2026. Figures reflect current asking prices, not verified closed sales.

At \$182/sq. ft., the subject is priced about 10% below the average of its own active competition — meaning a buyer comparing it side-by-side against other homes currently on the market in this price band is, on a square-footage basis, seeing the subject as the better-priced option, before any credit is given for the land and outbuildings none of the alternatives include.

5 Approach 3 — Replacement Cost: What New Construction Actually Costs Here

Set the history aside entirely for a moment. If a buyer wanted to build a brand-new, 4,677 sq. ft. home to a standard finish

level in York, Lancaster, or Cumberland County today, current regional construction pricing looks like this:

Construction Tier	Cost / Sq. Ft.	What It Buys
Standard Custom	\$200 - \$280	Quality construction, pre-selected finishes, granite counters, modern insulation — brand new, on a house with none of the subject's history, land, or outbuildings.
Upgraded Custom	\$280 - \$350	Hardwood floors, custom cabinetry, expanded outdoor living space.
Premium Custom	\$350 - \$400+	Designer tile, high-end fixtures, heated floors, whole-home automation.
741 Wyndamere Rd (Subject)	\$182	4,677 sq. ft. of restored 1797 stone architecture with original hand-hewn beams, four fireplaces, and museum-grade millwork that cannot be reproduced at any price point — PLUS 2.54 acres, a detached guest/office complex, a historic barn, and two silos.

Source: Central Pennsylvania custom home construction cost data (York, Lancaster, Cumberland counties), pulled September 1, 2026. Figures reflect construction cost only and exclude land.

At \$182/sq. ft. all-in — including the land — the subject is priced below even the low end of standard new construction (\$200/sq. ft.) for the same square footage, before any value is assigned to the 2.54 acres, the detached guest apartment and office complex, the historic barn and silos, or the simple fact that hand-hewn 18th-century beams, original wide-plank floors, and a documented 1797 provenance cannot be built new at any price. A buyer is effectively acquiring finished square footage below current construction cost, with the land, outbuildings, and irreplaceable historic fabric layered on top for free.

6 County Market Context

\$316,108 MEDIAN SALE PRICE York County, trailing 3 mo.	\$170 MEDIAN \$ / SQ. FT. York County	+7.2% YOY PRICE GROWTH accelerating market	8 days AVG. DAYS ON MARKET very low supply
--	--	---	---

Source: Redfin York County, PA housing market data, pulled September 1, 2026.

York County is a seller's market: homes are moving in an average of 8 days, and the median price per square foot has risen 7.2% year-over-year. Against a county-wide median of \$170/sq. ft. for ordinary housing stock, the subject's \$182/sq. ft. represents only a modest 7% premium — in a market where prices are actively climbing and inventory is scarce. That premium is easily explained by the subject's acreage, outbuildings, and restoration, and would likely look conservative, not aggressive, if the county's price trend continues.

7 Unique Value Drivers Not Reflected in Any \$/Sq. Ft. Figure

Every calculation above is deliberately conservative: it prices the subject purely on finished square footage, the one metric every comparable shares. None of it credits the features below, which is precisely why the case for \$849,900 is stronger than the numbers alone suggest.

2.54 acres	Multiples of a typical suburban lot in this market, with room for privacy, gardens, and grounds none of the comps above can offer.
Detached guest / office complex	A self-contained apartment (bed, full kitchen, full bath) plus an executive office with its own bath and rec room — a second dwelling's worth of function most \$800K-\$900K listings simply don't have.
Historic barn, two silos, smokehouse	Irreplaceable period agricultural structures — decorative and functional assets no new-construction home can include.
Documented 1797 provenance	An authenticated roofline inscription anchoring the property's story; provenance research is ongoing and adds narrative and archival value that appreciates over time.

Four fireplaces, hand-hewn beams, original floors	Restoration-grade original fabric — the exact features that cost the most (and are frequently impossible) to replicate in a renovation or new build.
Full modern systems	Multi-zone HVAC, gourmet kitchen, main-floor laundry — the buyer is not trading modern comfort for historic character; the restoration delivers both.

8 Conclusion

Three independent methods — a local price-per-square-foot baseline, a survey of active competing inventory, and a replacement-cost analysis — all converge on the same conclusion: \$849,900 is a defensible, and arguably conservative, price for 741 Wyndamere Road.

- vs. 5 nearby sold comps: subject is only +9% per sq. ft. despite ~5x the land and a full outbuilding complex.
- vs. 4 active competing listings: subject is -10% per sq. ft. — the better-priced option among a buyer's real alternatives today.
- vs. new construction cost: subject is priced below standard-tier building cost, before land, outbuildings, or irreplaceable historic fabric are counted at all.
- vs. York County median: subject carries just a 7% premium over the county-wide \$/sq. ft., in a market appreciating 7.2% year-over-year with 8-day average time on market.

No comparable exists for the Henry Miller House because properties like it are not made anymore. What this analysis demonstrates is that a buyer does not need to take that scarcity on faith — the math, built entirely from ordinary, verifiable market data, already supports the price.

Methodology & Data Notes

- This analysis uses a multi-approach valuation method rather than a traditional matched-comp grid, because no directly comparable historic property with similar acreage, outbuildings, and restoration scope has sold in this market recently. This is a standard, disclosed adaptation for unique and one-of-a-kind properties.
- Sold and active comparable data sourced from Redfin and Zillow public listing records for the immediate Lewisberry / Fairview Township area, pulled September 1, 2026. Comparable properties are ordinary, non-historic homes without significant acreage or outbuildings and are used solely to establish a local \$/sq. ft. baseline, not as direct equivalents.
- York County market statistics (median sale price, median \$/sq. ft., year-over-year trend, days on market) sourced from Redfin county-level housing market data, pulled September 1, 2026.
- New-construction cost-per-square-foot ranges reflect published 2026 custom home building cost data for York, Lancaster, and Cumberland counties and represent construction cost only, exclusive of land.
- Publicly assessed tax value (\$224,860 per York County records) is not used in this analysis, as Pennsylvania county tax assessments are based on historical base-year valuations and do not reflect current fair market value.
- This document is intended to support pricing discussions and does not constitute a formal fee appraisal. A licensed appraiser's opinion of value, where required (e.g., for financing), should be obtained independently.